

Investigating the Causes of the Low Rate of Female Literacy at the Secondary School Level in District Panjgur

Shereen Amjid Ali¹

1. Independent Researcher/ Admin Assistant, Strengthening Participatory Organization, Panjgur, Balochistan, Pakistan
Corresponding email: shereenamjad26@gmail.com

Abstract

The research was based on finding the causes of the low literacy rate of females at the secondary level in Panjgur, which is a very effective and important parameter for measuring a society's social development. Literacy also explains the fundamental reasons for social problems like political unawareness, crime rate, and terrorism, which have become cancer. Qualitative data and thematic analysis were applied. Semi-structured is used for the data collection process. The study's findings concerned these major issues: Poverty, Lack of awareness, Gender discrimination, Government mismanagement, and lack of awareness. Respondents from two government girls' schools of Municipal Committee Khudabadan District Panjgur were chosen. Most respondents opined that poverty was the major reason and linked it with the government's responsibility to eliminate poverty. The second major reason that people opined was gender discrimination. They believed there was a need for a social and religious campaign to avoid further damage in this regard. Apart from the semi-structured interviews were conducted. They said lack of awareness was a major reason behind low literacy. After reviewing the opinions of teachers, parents, and students, we conclusively conclude that though core causes exist, the country's illiteracy elimination needs a huge state-sponsored effort. This study critically analysed poverty, gender discrimination, and government mismanagement as the most important reasons. Governments should undertake multi-pronged policies in this regard, with a particular focus on excluding finance from education, either directly or indirectly, and also need to use the services of religious scholars to spread the message about the importance of education.

Keywords: *Panjgur; Female literacy; Secondary School*

Introduction

The literacy rate in Pakistan in the 2022 province –for males and females has improved by 58% to 70%. The 2021–22 survey indicates that Pakistan's literacy rate is at a standstill. Female primary level enrolment remained between 54 and 57 percent. In contrast, the male statistics have improved during the last three years. According to current facts and data,

Pakistan's overall enrolment rate is 97,462,900, with primary enrolment at 22650000 and post-secondary enrolment at 2884400 and 1949000, respectively (Akhtar, 2022). Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has a 55.3% primary level enrolment rate, whereas Punjab has a 67.7% statistic. In 2018, Balochistan's literacy rate was 55.5% of the public rate, while Sindh's was 62.2% (Akhtar, 2022). A persistent and significant problem in Balochistan is the low literacy rate. The lowest literacy rate among all provinces is found in Balochistan. In Balochistan, 44% of people are illiterate, despite the fact that those that are literate cannot write or read. One of the things that can destroy a nation's social and economic fabric is illiteracy. Everyone has the right to a good education, but in Balochistan, nobody receives one. This is due to unemployment, poverty, and crime in the province. As a result, we may not see high-quality illiteracy in Balochistan, which is a very bad situation because no one is paying attention to our province. As a result, Balochistan suffers greatly in all areas, particularly in the education sector. This study looks into the reasons behind the poor secondary literacy rate among females in the Panjgur district. According to this viewpoint, literacy is a human right, a tool for empowering oneself, and a way to advance society and humanity, according to the official report (UNESCO, 2010). Literacy is essential for educational opportunities. In order to eradicate poverty, lower the child mortality rate, slow down population growth, achieve gender equality, and guarantee sustainable development, peace, and democracy, literacy is essential and should be a fundamental component of all basic education. According to Nelson Mandela, education is the most effective means of persuading people to modernize the globe. According to the UNDP (2011) and UNESCO (2000) reports, Pakistan is confronted with issues in the areas of reproduction, poverty, and health as a result of the unequal educational attainment of women, which eventually contributes to the low literacy rate among women.

In male-dominated society, women have been portrayed as a submissive, home-bound, sensitive, and less intelligent group. In a same vein, they are discouraged, humiliated, and under pressure to pursue education. Consequently, women are denied the most important right to receive an education. The claim that education is the primary driver of a nation's progress is accurate. According to Veenhoven (2010), the real state of education in Pakistan presents a depressing picture, especially in the Province of Balochistan, where 70% of girls drop out of school and education is appalling. This ultimately results in a low literacy rate among women. For people and societies in Balochistan, the low female literacy percentage represents a significant educational loss. In Balochistan, the government has **tried** to provide increased access to and involvement in the educational system. District Panjgur has been dealing with a poor literacy rate among female secondary school pupils, similar to other districts in Balochistan Province. The literature shows that less studies have been done to look at the reasons behind the low secondary

school literacy rate among females. The goal of the study is to identify the contributing factors to the female student dropout rate in the specified district. Thus, this study investigates the reasons behind Panjgur's low female student literacy rate. This research closes the gaps by examining the goal of the study is to identify the contributing factors to the female student dropout rate in the specified district. Thus, this study investigates the reasons behind Panjgur's low female student literacy rate. By examining the factors causing the low literacy rate among female students in the Panjgur district's secondary schools, this study closes the gaps.

Research Methodology

The related study used a qualitative approach. In order to bring female students' enrolment process into functional schools or learning settings, the study sought to investigate the factors or causes of their low literacy rate. By using a qualitative design, the researcher was able to conduct interviews to investigate and uncover new ideas, people, perspectives, and experiences (**Fielded**, 2021). The population is the collection of people or participants from which an investigator or researcher obtains data to fill in the blanks. Creswell (2004). The population of the current research study was female students, the head teachers, and the parents of secondary-level students in the district of **Panjgur**, Balochistan. Sampling is a method or approach whereby a small portion of the target population is selected for additional study or inquiry in order to gather the data needed to address the research topic. Convenience sampling was the sampling strategy used by the researcher to select interview subjects. Eight people will be chosen as sample interview subjects during the participant selection process. Two parents, two head teachers, two pupils, and two teachers from two government girls' schools in the Municipal Committee Khudabadan District of Panjgur will be among the participants in the sampling. In a qualitative research study, six to twelve individuals can be used to provide detailed information about a research topic (Johnson and Christenson, 2004). The researcher used a qualitative approach to gather data. The aforementioned data gathering strategy was used to conduct semi-structured interviews. Geroge (2022) claims that a semi-structured interview gathers information by posing queries in a pre-established theme context. The researcher went on to say that semi-structured interviews work well for gathering open-ended, qualitative data. Additionally, it examines the participants' ideas, worries, feelings, and convictions around a specific subject.

In order to choose codes and create themes, qualitative data was **analyzed** and described using a thematic analysis. The researcher adopted a question-by-question approach for **analyzing** the gathered data because this approach is very fruitful for the researcher in **organizing** the data across all respondents in two schools from Municipal Committee Khudabadan Panjgur to identify similarities and differences. The audio recordings of the participants were transcribed. Data

transcription is a part of this procedure. To identify the emergent themes, the researcher contrasted and compared the data. Each participant's response was coded and verified by the researcher. In order to identify and label concepts and phrases in interview transcriptions and field notes, the researcher first identified the material, then coded it, and then described it, as stated by Miles and Huberman (1994).

Ethical Consideration

The researcher will treat the respondents with respect and confidence. In this study, the researcher will not put the participating respondents at risk of harm. The researcher will consider the norms, values, and cultural aspects. No disclosure of participant identity pseudonyms. Data will be kept safe and

Findings and discussion

Theme 1: Ideas about Education

The theme ideas of education refer to what participants perceive about education, the importance of education, and the process of education. The discussion below presents the findings from the participants' perspectives.

A student in class 10th said that the basic need for education is necessary for every human being. "Education is a basic need for every human; without education, every human is useless; with education, you know the right path." This shows that education is the first need of any human being; without education, nobody can do anything useful in their entire life. Education shows you the right and clear path to your destination easily. Another student gives me the same response about the basic need for education. A parent of a class 9th student said education is very important for all. "In my opinion, education is a fundamental need of human beings." Education is forming a necessary base or core of every human being. One participant mentioned that education is necessary for all, but some people do not give importance to female education and do not know the changes that come due to education, stated.

"My opinion about education is this: education is necessary for all males and females, but unfortunately, Panjguri people don't know the value of education. If a person is educated, they can change the nation and the world."

A teacher added that the basic requirements of life, such as food, shelter, and education, are also necessary for all human beings, male and female. Still, unluckily, the people of Panjgur do

not know the importance of education. They do not know if a person who gets an education can change the world.

Similarly, a teacher discusses her thoughts that education gives awareness and shows you the right path and maintain your life by saying that;

Education makes you aware of what your rights are. If a person knows his rights, then they know what is good or bad for them, and when they know what is good or bad for them, they get a lot of chances; education shows you the right path a person properly maintain their life.

A teacher said education gives you knowledge about wrong and right. A person knows his rights. They know their good and bad because getting an education gives them many chances in life. Education makes you a good human and organizes your life.

Another student expressed her views in the same context that local people must be aware of education: "We must make the local people aware that they must educate their children." Data shows that it's necessary to give awareness to all people, male and female, about education in the same context; the same student further added that males should give awareness to their families and let them be educated. The department should conduct seminars and get together to educate people about education.

In the same way, it is fascinating another student of class 9th who highlighted the process of education knowledge with different resources.

Education is a process of learning, gaining, and getting knowledge from different sources and generating new things. Education gives us new ideas and new and positive habits that make our lives perfect.

Findings reveal that this student has identified the process of education. Education is a series of actions or steps to achieve a particular end by getting knowledge or skills through experience. Obtain knowledge from books from places from media from people arising new things. Education makes your thoughts polish your personality clear, clean your habits, and make your life as good as possible.

In addition to this, the parents of a student shared her views that education develops you and gives you the solution to all your problems, which are daily basis involved in our life by saying that;

[In my point of view, the education we take a human become fully developed means it becomes fully prepared that whatever comes in life they take any decision, although there are a

lot of problems in life an educated person can solve them in a good way and will spend their life in a good way]

Data reveals that education makes you mature and ready to do any task that comes up in life, regardless of how hard life is going. You make any decision because you have a lot of ideas. You think wide even though there are a lot of issues in practical life as well-
An educated person can handle it in a good way and maintain their life in a better way.

In short, theme 1 reflected the basic need for education, to inform people about education and the process of education to develop people to get an education.

Theme 2: benefits of education

The researcher interviewed the head teacher, teachers, parents, students, and public sector staff members. They shared their ideas about the benefits of getting educated. Under theme 2, the benefits of education mean that societies with high educational completion rates have less crime, better overall health, and civic involvement Poverty Reduction, Connecting Across Borders, feeling of achievement, More Productivity, Better Communication, Ability to think critically, identifying skills and You have more discipline.

According to a participant, there is great understanding and recognition between right and wrong.

"Education helps us to understand the world better; by education, we could differentiate between good and bad," Data says that education assists us in a clearer version of understanding the world and the innate difference between good and bad.

Another participant shared her ideas about the condition of Panjgur's primary literacy rate.

In the same context, a participant said that parents did not allow girls to study in the past, but now they will study.

"The female literacy rate in Panjgur is better than in the past because, in the past, parents did not allow their females to study, but nowadays they are joining different institutions." This means that most educated females in Panjgur are now finer than past parents who don't allow

their girls to further education. They don't allow girls out of the city to study, but nowadays, there are a lot of institutions where females are getting admitted to different courses and are satisfied.

Another participant elaborated her ideas in the same context: "The literacy rate in Panjgur is much better than in the past. People are aware of education, and now people are competitive. They know that without education, they cannot fulfil their wishes."

The ideas show that the literacy rate in Panjgur has improved much more than in the past. People are conscious of education and strongly desire to be more successful than others. They understand that without education, they cannot succeed in any field.

In conclusion, theme 2 discussed the benefits of getting an Education, Societies with high educational completion rates, less crime, better overall health and civic involvement, Poverty reduction, connecting across borders, feeling of achievement, more productivity, better communication, ability to think critically, and identification skills.

Theme 3: Issues of female literacy /Education

- **Financial issues**
- **Access [transport, issues]**
- **Family issues**

Many females face a lot of issues and problems, and education for females in rural areas and conservative societies is an even bigger challenge. There is a lack of schools and teachers in rural areas; parents don't allow them to further studies; parents argue that they cannot afford to send their children to school because of poverty, early marriage issues, and transport issues.

A participant shared her thoughts about challenges females face in their daily routines, such as societal issues, financial issues, harassment cases, and transport issues.

"There are different challenges which are facing females such as our society norms and values; people do not allow females due to financial problems, further harassment cases and transport facilities."

Data shows many reasons for females to continue their studies and financial issues. Their parents can't afford the school expenses because of poverty. Although we know that the government provides free education, books are also freely provided by the government. Their board fees and school are far from the house. They cannot go without a taxi, so they have little money to hire a taxi for their children. Society creates rules that bind girls to study, which negatively impacts them. Parents listen to society about harassment cases, and they become afraid to send their girls out of home and out of the city. If a girl goes to school on foot, some boys

follow her and tease her, and she is afraid and leaves the school. If someone is interested in educating their female, there are transport issues.

Another participant expressed her views about family issues, such as lack of quality of education, financial problems, security issues, and transport problems.

The majority of females have family issues because these families do not have educational backgrounds, and if we see our society in Panjgur, there is no quality of education. Now that the university is open, people are becoming aware of it. But still, if somebody cannot afford the expenses of education, they cannot go further. Our environment is like a female cannot go anywhere alone; there are security, transport, and pick-and-drop issues. These are the basic challenges that females face.]

Data reveal that many females have family matters because their families do not have an educational background. If we take the example of our area, Panjgur, there is no good education. After opening a university, people are now aware of education. However, if anyone cannot afford the college and university fees, they cannot continue their studies. Our surroundings are like that a female cannot go outside alone, there are security issues, and there are transport issues because the schools and colleges are so far from their houses they cannot go on foot, which is a big challenge for females.

In the same context, a student shared her view about financial issues in order to educate their children. They give their full support to their males rather than females.

[If I see my own family and talk about that. They have financial issues with educating their children, and it is common that if there is a brother and sister in the family, every parent in our society first always supports their boys. They support girls if they want, and if they don't have any financial issues, they support their girls. But they do more for their boys than girls.]

This statement shows that according to this student I see in my family and talk about them, they have financial issues to educate their children, and it's very usual in our society, all parents think the same if they have something, they invest in their boys their full support is only for boys, if want to support their girls and have no any financial problem they support and invest for their girls.

Another student gives her ideas that girls face

"So many challenges are there for girls' education and safety. They cannot go alone anywhere, but boys can go. There are transport issues as well." The statement says there are many problems with girls' education in society. Girls cannot go outside alone. Someone with her parents must be afraid to send their females alone anywhere, but males can go alone anywhere,

and there are transport issues. These problems are not giving females the path to educating themselves.

Another participant said that females are facing family issues and departmental problems. Not everyone, but most women in our society, faces problems. They are not getting enough opportunities.

[We see females' education and that they face many issues. For example, they have family issues, departmental issues, and family members who are the owners of their homes, and from all sides, they are facing problems. We cannot blame everybody, but most females face issues. They do not have enough opportunities to complete their education.]

Data shows that if we see female education, females face a lot of problems like family issues. Families are not supportive if they support and give permission to further studies and for a job, but outside, females face so many issues like departmental problems. I am not blaming everybody in our society, but the majority of females are suffering from these issues. There is no sufficient chance to complete their education.

A teacher shares her ideas in the same context that early marriage is the biggest problem for a female to continue their studies; having a lot of responsibilities, they can't further move on.

[In my opinion, the biggest challenge for girls is getting married early; it is the biggest challenge, and they cannot continue their education. After marriage, they have a lot of responsibilities which are necessary for them.]

The statement says that the biggest problem girls are facing is early marriage. Of course, because of poverty, families have financial issues. They see their society as there is no security for females, and if they allow for education, then the transport issue comes. Hence, they finally decide that the best thing is that they should marry their girls, so at an early age, they marry their females. After that, a girl wants to study, but the responsibilities don't allow them to go further. In summary, theme 3 elaborates on females' major issues, like family, finances, transportation, and early marriages.

Theme 4: opportunity for female education

Girls' educational power is cost-effective and reduces inequities. It contributes to more stable and resilient societies that allow everyone, including boys and men, to realize their potential. But girls' education isn't just about getting into school. According to the participant, she said that because of conservative thoughts and not giving enough opportunities to girls, illiteracy will end if girls are given the same level of opportunity.

[If I say in Panjgur, the illiteracy will never finish because if people want to finish illiteracy from Panjgur, they first finish their conservative thoughts and give the same opportunity that is

always given to boys. Try to bring the girls to the same level the boys already have. Then maybe the illiteracy will finish from Panjgur.]

This finding shows that illiteracy will never end until the people of Panjgur finish their negative thoughts from their minds. They must give the same possibilities that the boys have, and they should try to bring the girls to the same level that the boys already have.

In short, theme 4 reflected that the opportunities to females, females must be given equal opportunities which males get from society and their families.

Theme 5: ways to eliminate low literacy

To eliminate low literacy, we must find a way to finish low literacy without knowing anything. The main factors responsible for low literacy levels attempt to solve these problems. A student share her ideas about corruption and trained and honest teachers.

"Illiteracy can finish from Panjgur when corruption finished in the field of education. When teachers are well trained and honest, also, education officers and when merit will be restarted." data tells that illiteracy can end in Panjgur when corruption ends in the field of education; for example, the selection of teachers is not in merit base. Unqualified teachers are hired. When teachers are properly trained and honestly do their jobs sincerely, they perform their responsibilities. Also, the educational officers do their duties properly and honestly and when the merit will be revived.

In the same context, according to a participant, there are a lot of methods by which we can finish illiteracy, like school facilities, transportation facilities, and career concealing in society.

"Several methods and techniques help us to educate or finish illiteracy from Panjgur, such as the best school facilities, transportation facilities, and carriers concealed in a different society." The statement says many methods and techniques help us educate or end Panjgur illiteracy, such as the best school facilities, transportation facilities, and concealed careers in different societies. Like building more schools and facilitating more and more schools and colleges, like providing them with vans and buses, and society conducts meetings to help identify factors influencing your career development and help the public about their interests, abilities, and values.

Another participant added that illiteracy would be finished, and the minister of Panjgur would take positive steps to give to schools, colleges, etc. The main thing is that teachers do their jobs sincerely.

[The illiteracy can be finished if the minister of Panjgur acts on it. The minister should give schools, colleges, and universities in Panjgur to finish illiteracy. But the main thing is that the teacher should educate the children.]

The statement says illiteracy will be finished in Panjgur if the minister takes serious action. Panjgur minister provides more schools, colleges, and universities and posts good,

qualified, educated teachers. And find all the ghost teachers and strictly tell them to do their duties. Everybody should take responsibility sincerely, and then we will finish the illiteracy from Panjgur.

In conclusion, theme 4 mentioned the causes of illiteracy in Panjgur. The main problem is corruption; uneducated officers are higher in the educational department, untrained and unqualified teachers are appointed, people don't know about education, and they must conduct seminars about career counselling.

Discussion and conclusion

After a prolonged review of the findings and related opinions from various connected sectors, I, the researcher, conclusively identify the causes and solutions for the low literacy rate of female education at the secondary level in district Panjgur. However, various reasons and factors are responsible for the phenomenon, such as sponsored efforts to eliminate illiteracy in district Panjgur. Issues of female literacy are financial issues, security issues, transportation access, and social norms and values, which have been inferred, investigated, and identified by participants within this research study. There are causes of the low literacy rate of females at the secondary level in district Panjgur. I critically analysed and investigated where results and findings came to the point of selection that poverty, gender discrimination, security, transportation, social norms and values, and government mismanagement were the most important causes and reasons why government and society, teachers, intellectuals and parents roles always in all for the solution in respect of ideas to get an education, benefits to get an education, provision of opportunity of education and a way to eliminate low literacy in district Panjgur.

The government is to be the ultimate authority in this concern. If we want a gigantic shift in this concern, we need a rudimentary and concrete effort by the government on a massive scale. Nothing in the private sector can fund the wide field of primary education. So, we think that without a special effort by the state, Pakistan will continue to crawl as it is now.

It is easy to say that these are basic issues. They represented obstacles to the improvement of literacy figures. These confirm the study's findings—however, the dimension of seeing these changed. These factors are economic and social, as indicated in the assumption. Economics constraints, for example, are a big issue. But if we find that it's a government responsibility. No one can be as powerful as the government and its effective policies. Directly, the government can eliminate the main reason, or the effect of that main reason can be finished.

The findings show that education assists us in understanding the world clearly and the difference between good and bad. The ideas show that the literacy rate in Panjgur has improved much more

than in the past. People are conscious of education, and they have a strong desire to be more successful than others. They understand that without education, they cannot succeed in any field. In another research, the same context and similar findings show that education externalities are social or public benefits from the education of each individual that benefit others in the society in both current and future generations (McMahon 2004).

Another finding of research work reported that illiteracy could end in Panjgur when corruption ends in education; for example, the selection of teachers is not on a merit basis, due to which unqualified teachers are hired. When properly trained and honest, teachers do their jobs sincerely and perform their responsibilities. Secondly, the educational officers do their duties properly and honestly when the merit will be revived.

Khan *et al.* (2021) require highly qualified teachers to influence a child's personality better. First, there is a shortage of teaching staff at most schools, and second, the teachers they employ are neither qualified nor trained enough due to such teachers resorting to old tutoring techniques. It is a natural fact that the more schools have skilled teaching staff members, the more chances of enrolling in schools are there.

This finding shows that illiteracy will never end until the people of Panjgur finish the negative thoughts in their minds. They must give the same possibilities that the boys have, and they should try to bring the girls to the same level as boys. Khan *et al.* (2021) further stated that the reasons that prevent girls from getting an education are social taboos, tribal labels, etc. Besides, girls also faced deranged attitudes regarding their education from the community and parents, which can cause low enrolment in Balochistan schools. Shah and Shah (2012) supported the current study's findings regarding the lack of school enrolment. Revealed that a lack of educational facilities and poverty could lead to low enrolment in schools, which can lead to low literacy, especially in girls' Education in Pakistan (Durrani, 2008; Westbrook, Pryor, Orr, & Durrani, 2013). Research work Findings declare that there are many dares for female to continue their higher studies despite financial issues, expenses of schools, and poverty. Although we know the government provides free education with only free textbooks through government sides. It is here that, schools are far from houses, and without proper transportation, they cannot go, so they do not have that much money to hire a taxi for their children.

In this research, the statement says there are many problems with girls' education in society. Girls cannot go outside alone. Someone with her parents must be afraid to send their females alone anywhere, but males can go alone anywhere, and there are transport issues. These problems do not give females the path to educate themselves. According to Jamal (2016), He stated that girls don't feel they go to school because of security and safety reasons. The parents

also feel reluctant to send their daughter to school. Hence, it is concluded that these barriers and cordons lead to low literacy among females in Balochistan.

Recommendation

Based on the study's findings, some important steps are recommended.

- The government should introduce a stipend to fulfil their educational need. Primarily focusing on the government schools so that a cheaper education could be provided. This should be conducted clearly in financing schemes to ensure proper implementation.
- There should be a state-supported social awareness campaign. The campaign should have a religious dimension so that gender discrimination and misinterpretation can be checked. The campaigns should be on a large scale.
- The schools should be restructured in terms of facilities. And transportation facilities should be provided for the girls.
- Females' education is necessary for public awareness. The government should initiate a door-to-door effort to educate the people about the benefits of sending daughters to schools.
- Compulsory education should be free.
- Training of teachers must be done. There is a need to hire qualified and skilled teachers in large numbers and build the capacity of the already hired teachers through professional training programs.

References

- Abbasi, F. (2014). Situation analysis of the education system in Balochistan. *Spo Discussion paper series*, 169.
- Abdulwahab, O. I. (2012). Practical guides to project writing for students in polytechnics, colleges and universities.
- Ahmad, E., Arshad, M. F., & Ahmad, A. (1991). Learning and earning profiles in Pakistan's informal sector. *Pakistan Economic and Social Review*, 29(2), 77-98
- Awan, N., Schneider, T., & Till, J. (2013). *Spatial agency: Other ways of doing architecture*.
- Bhatt, I. (2017). *Assignments as controversies: Digital literacy and writing in classroom practice*. Routledge.
- Caudle, S. L. (2004). Qualitative data analysis. *Handbook of practical program evaluation*, 2(1), 417-438.
- ISBN Khan, F. Z., Kamran, M., Saeed, A. A. R., & Faizi, W. U. N. (2021). Barriers responsible to females' low literacy at the primary level in **Balochistan** province of **Pakistan**: Social and economic barriers. *Humanity. Soc. Sci. Rev*, 9, 161-168.
- Jamal, A. (2014). Men's perception of women's role and girls' Education among Pashtun tribes of Pakistan: A qualitative Delphi study. *Cultural and Pedagogical Inquiry*, 6(2).
<https://doi.org/10.18733/C3RC7B>
- Jamal, A. (2016). Why he won't send his daughter to school—Barriers to girls' Education in Northwest Pakistan: A qualitative Delphi study of Pashtun men. *SAGE Open*, 6(3), 2158244016663798. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2158244016663798>
- Johnson, R. B., & Onwuegbuzie, A. J. (2004). Mixed methods research: A research paradigm whose time has come. *Educational researcher*, 33(7), 14-26.
- Khalid, H. S., & Mukhtar, E. M. (2002). The future of girls' Education in Pakistan: A study on policy measures and other factors determining girls' education. *Islamabad: UNESCO*.
- Malik, A. B. (2011). Policy analysis of Education in Punjab Province. *Islamabad, Pakistan: UNESCO*. Retrieved January, 4, 2017.
- McMahon, W. W. (2004). The social and external benefits of education. *International handbook on the economics of education*, 211, 259.

- Rehman, A. A., & Alharthi, K. (2016). An introduction to research paradigms. *International Journal of Educational Investigations*, 3(8), 51-59.
- Shah, S., & Shah, U. (2012). Girl education in rural Pakistan. *Revista Internacional de Sociología de la Educación*, 1(2), 180-207.
- Smith, J. A., & Fieldsend, M. (2021). *Interpretative phenomenological analysis*. American Psychological Association.
- Smith, Jonathan A. (1995) Semi structured interviewing and qualitative analysis. In: Smith, Jonathan A. and Harre, R. and Van Langenhove, L. (eds.) *Rethinking Methods in Psychology*. Sage Publications, pp. 9-26.
- Stubbs, M. (1995). David Barton, Literacy: An introduction to the ecology of written language. Oxford: Blackwell, 1994 Pp. x, 247. Hb£ 40.00, 21.95. *Language in Society*, 24(4), 595-598.
- Unterhalter, E., & Brighouse, H. (2007). Distribution of what for social justice in education? The case of Education for All by 2015. In *Amartya Sen's capability approach and social justice in education* (pp. 67-86). Palgrave Macmillan, New York.
- Wagner, D. A. (2011). What happened to literacy? Historical and conceptual perspectives on literacy in UNESCO. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 31(3), 319-323.
- Westbrook, J., Pryor, J., Orr, D., & Durrani, N. (2013). *Pedagogy, curriculum, teaching practices and teacher education in developing countries. Technical Report*.